

Prove or disprove each of the following statements. Write detailed proof structures and justify your work.

1. For all natural numbers n , if there is a natural number k such that $n = 3k + 1$, then there is a natural number j such that $n^2 = 3j + 1$.

(Optional), write the statement symbolically, to help understand the structure:

$$\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, (\exists k \in \mathbb{N}, n = 3k + 1) \Rightarrow (\exists j \in \mathbb{N}, n^2 = 3j + 1)$$

Now Try a direct proof:

Assume n is a generic natural number # in order to introduce \forall

Assume $\exists k \in \mathbb{N}, n = 3k + 1$ # in order to introduce \Rightarrow

Then $n^2 = (3k + 1)^2$ # sub in k from assumption

Then $n^2 = 3(3k^2 + 2k) + 1$ # expand and factor 3 out

Then $\exists j \in \mathbb{N}, n^2 = 3j + 1$ # pick $j = (3k^2 + 2k) \in \mathbb{N}$

since $3, k, 2 \in \mathbb{N}$, which is closed under $+$ and \times

Then $\exists k \in \mathbb{N}, n = 3k + 1 \Rightarrow \exists j \in \mathbb{N}, n^2 = 3j + 1$ # introduced \Rightarrow

Conclude $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}(\exists k \in \mathbb{N}, n = 3k + 1) \Rightarrow (\exists j \in \mathbb{N}, n^2 = 3j + 1)$ # introduced \forall

2. For all real numbers r, s , if r and s are both positive, then $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \sqrt{r + s}$.

It seems too good to be true, so try a disproof. First, write the negation symbolically to understand the structure:

$$\exists r, s \in \mathbb{R}, (r > 0 \wedge s > 0) \wedge \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r + s}$$

Pick $r = 1, s = 1$ # the first, and easiest, reals to work with to introduce \exists

Then $r, s \in \mathbb{R}$ # $r = s = 1 \in \mathbb{R}$

Then $r > 0 \wedge s > 0$ # $1 > 0$

Then $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \sqrt{1} + \sqrt{1} = 1 + 1 = 2 \neq \sqrt{2} = \sqrt{1 + 1} = \sqrt{r + s}$ # substitute $r = s = 1$ and arithmetic

Then $\exists r, s \in \mathbb{R}, (r > 0 \wedge s > 0) \wedge \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r + s}$ # introduced \exists

3. For all real numbers r, s , if r and s are both positive, then $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r + s}$.

First, write the statement symbolically:

$$\forall r \in \mathbb{R}^+, \forall s \in \mathbb{R}^+, r > 0 \wedge s > 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r + s}$$

Second, try a direct proof:

Assume $r \in \mathbb{R}^+$ and $s \in \mathbb{R}^+$.

Assume $r > 0$ and $s > 0$.

Then, $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \dots$ No obvious way to continue.

Next, try an indirect proof:

Assume $r \in \mathbb{R}^+$ and $s \in \mathbb{R}^+$.

Assume $\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} = \sqrt{r + s}$.

Then, $(\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s})^2 = (\sqrt{r + s})^2$. # square both sides

Then, $(\sqrt{r})^2 + 2\sqrt{r}\sqrt{s} + (\sqrt{s})^2 = r + s$. # expand both sides

Then, $2\sqrt{rs} = 0$. # subtract $r + s$ from both sides

Then, $rs = 0$. # divide by 2 and square both sides

Then, $r = 0 \vee s = 0$.

Now, do a sub-proof by cases.

Assume $r = 0$.

Then, $r \not> 0$.

Then, $r \not> 0 \vee s \not> 0$.

Then, $\neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$.

Assume $s = 0$.

Then, $s \not> 0$.

Then, $r \not> 0 \vee s \not> 0$.

Then, $\neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$.

In either case, $\neg(r > 0 \wedge s > 0)$.

Then, $r > 0 \wedge s > 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r + s}$. # introduced contrapositive

Then, $\forall r \in \mathbb{R}^+, \forall s \in \mathbb{R}^+, r > 0 \wedge s > 0 \Rightarrow \sqrt{r} + \sqrt{s} \neq \sqrt{r + s}$.

4. For all real numbers x and y , $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$ exactly when $x = \pm y$.

First, write the statement symbolically (be careful to handle “ \pm ” correctly):

$$\forall x \in \mathbb{R}, \forall y \in \mathbb{R}, x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Leftrightarrow (x = y \vee x = -y)$$

Second, start the proof structure for the universal quantifiers:

Assume $x \in \mathbb{R}$ and $y \in \mathbb{R}$.

To prove an equivalence, we prove the implication in each direction.

First assume $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$.

Then, $x^3(x + y) - y^3(x + y) = 0$. # factor out the expression

Then, $(x^3 - y^3)(x + y) = 0$. # factor out the expression

Then, $x^3 - y^3 = 0 \vee x + y = 0$. # $ab = 0 \Leftrightarrow a = 0 \vee b = 0$

Now, do a sub-proof by cases.

Assume $x^3 - y^3 = 0$.

Then, $x^3 = y^3$ # add y^3 to both sides

Then, $x = y$ # take cube roots on both sides

Then, $x = y \vee x = -y$ # introduce \vee

Assume $x + y = 0$.

Then, $x = -y$ # subtract y from both sides

Then, $x = y \vee x = -y$ # introduce \vee

In either case, $x = y \vee x = -y$.

Then, $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Rightarrow x = \pm y$.

Next assume $x = \pm y$.

Then, $x = y \vee x = -y$. # expand “ \pm ”

Now, do a sub-proof by cases.

Assume $x = y$.

Then, $x^3 = y^3$. # cube both sides

Then, $x^3 - y^3 = 0$. # subtract y^3 from both sides

Then, $(x^3 - y^3)(x + y) = 0$. # multiply both sides by $(x + y)$

Then, $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$. # expand

Assume $x = -y$.

Then, $x + y = 0$. # add y to both sides

Then, $(x^3 - y^3)(x + y) = 0$. # multiply both sides by $(x^3 - y^3)$

Then, $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$. # expand

In both cases, $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$.

Then, $x = \pm y \Rightarrow x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0$.

Then, $x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Leftrightarrow x = \pm y$. # introduce \Leftrightarrow

Then, $\forall x \in \mathbb{R}, \forall y \in \mathbb{R}, x^4 + x^3y - xy^3 - y^4 = 0 \Leftrightarrow (x = y \vee x = -y)$.

(Notice how the detailed proof structure makes it easy to keep track of assumptions, and cases and sub-cases, and to know exactly when we are done.)